Transparency, Accountability and Public Participation

Francisco A. Magno

ADRi Virtual Town Hall Discussion
“Transparency and Accountability: Regaining Public Trust through Democratic Governance”
June 30, 2020, 9-11 am
Facing Up to the Democratic Recession

Larry Diamond

Democracy has been in a global recession for most of the last decade. Yet the picture is not entirely bleak. We have not seen "a third reverse wave." The key imperative in the near term is to work to reform and consolidate the democracies that have emerged during the third wave— the majority of which remain illiberal and unstable, if they remain democratic at all. It is vital that democrats in the established democracies not lose faith. Democrats have the better set of ideas. Democracy may be receding somewhat in practice, but it is still globally ascendant in peoples' values and aspirations.
Democracy Versus the Pandemic
The Coronavirus Is Emboldening Autocrats the World Over

By Larry Diamond  June 13, 2020
**Philippines**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political Rights</td>
<td>27/40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Liberties</td>
<td>35/60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PARTLY FREE**

**LAST YEAR’S SCORE & STATUS**

63/100  
Partly Free

Global freedom statuses are calculated on a weighted scale. See the methodology.
Philippines

61
/100

PARTLY FREE

Political Rights 26/40
Civil Liberties 35/60

LAST YEAR'S SCORE & STATUS 62/100  Partly Free

Global freedom statuses are calculated on a weighted scale. See the methodology.
**Philippines**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political Rights</td>
<td>25/40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Liberties</td>
<td>34/60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**LAST YEAR'S SCORE & STATUS**

61/100  Partly Free

Global freedom statuses are calculated on a weighted scale. [See the methodology](#).
How is budget transparency in the Philippines compared to others

**Indication:** Substantially higher than the global average score of 42.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2006" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2008" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2010" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2012" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2015" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="2017" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Available to the Public
- Not Produced
- Published Late, or Not Published Online, or Produced for Internal Use Only
Opportunities for public participation

- Executive: 42
- Legislature: 8
- Supreme Audit Institution: 78
1987 Philippine Constitution

- Art. 2, Sec. 23: “The state shall encourage non-governmental, community-based, or sectoral organizations that promote the welfare of the nation.”

- Art. 13, Sec. 15: “The state shall respect the role of independent people’s organizations to enable the people to pursue and protect, within the democratic framework, their legitimate and collective interests and aspirations through peaceful and lawful means.”

- Art. 13, Sec. 16: “The right of the people and their organizations to effective and reasonable participation at all levels of social, political and economic decision-making shall not be abridged. The state shall, by law, facilitate the establishment of adequate consultation mechanisms.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget reforms</th>
<th>Budget preparation</th>
<th>Budget legislation</th>
<th>Budget execution</th>
<th>Budget accountability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Budget Partnership Agreement (BPA)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bottom-up Budgeting (BuB)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens’ Participatory Audit (CPA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### OTHER NOTABLE PRACTICES IN THE BUDGET CYCLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementing CSO</th>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Tools used</th>
<th>Operating level/region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Concerned Citizens of Abra for Good Governance (CCAGG) | Bantay Lansangan  | Infrastructure monitoring     | • Road Monitoring Guide  
• Field monitoring and evaluation of infrastructure projects                                                     | Cordillera Administrative Region (CAR) |
| Caucus of Development NGO Networks (CODE-NGO)    |                   |                               |                                                                                                                     |                                      |
| Coalition Against Corruption (CAC)               | PDAF Watch        | Public expenditure tracking & procurement monitoring | • Public expenditure tracking of funds released for legislator’s PDAF  
• Interviews                                                                                 | Nationwide                          |
## OTHER NOTABLE PRACTICES IN THE BUDGET CYCLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementing CSO</th>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Tools used</th>
<th>Operating level/region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government Watch (G-Watch)</td>
<td>Bayanihang Eskwela</td>
<td>Infrastructure monitoring</td>
<td>• Checklist</td>
<td>Nationwide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rapid Capacity Assessment (RCA)</td>
<td>Budget formulation</td>
<td>• Competency assessment and good governance surveys • Interviews • Focus group discussions (FGDs)</td>
<td>Nationwide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Textbook Count</td>
<td>Procurement monitoring</td>
<td>• Volunteer Monitoring Report Form • Inspection and Acceptance Report Form</td>
<td>Nationwide</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## OTHER NOTABLE PRACTICES IN THE BUDGET CYCLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementing CSO</th>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Tools used</th>
<th>Operating level/region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Naga City People’s Council (NCPC)          | People’s Council          | Participatory planning and budgeting | • Community organizing and networking  
• Formation and institutionalization of mechanisms for effective people's participation in governance  | Region V                |
| National Movement for Free Election       | Medicine Monitoring Project | Procurement monitoring        | • Procurement Diagnostic Report  
• Public Bidding Checklist  
• Observer's Diagnostic Report  
• Delivery Monitoring Report  
• Inventory Report Form  | Nationwide                |
| Palawan Advocates for Good Governance     | Barangay Development Plans (BDPs) | Participatory planning | • Participatory rural appraisal  | Region IV-B              |
### OTHER NOTABLE PRACTICES IN THE BUDGET CYCLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementing CSO</th>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Tools used</th>
<th>Operating level/region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Procurement Watch, Inc.                               | Bantay Eskwela                    | Procurement monitoring and auditing | • Capacity building  
• Diagnostic Report  
• Pre-Delivery Inspection Form  
• Actual Delivery Report Form  
• Ending Inventory Count Form  
• Differential Expenditure Efficiency Measurement (DEEM) | Nationwide                        |
| Transparent Accountable Governance Program of the Asia Foundation | Budget Tracking for Transparent Accountable Governance (BTTAG) | Budget allocation | • Technical assistance to local governments  
• Promoting public-private partnership  
• Surveys and tracking studies  
• Working with the leagues of local governments  
• Partnership with civil society networks  
• Nurturing local resource institutions | Mindanao                           |
THE BANTAY LANSANGAN (ROAD WATCH) EXPERIENCE

Improving the Philippine Road Sector Through Vigilant Monitoring and Volunteerism

Affiliated Network for Social Accountability
in East Asia and the Pacific
connecting citizens to improve governance
Concerned Citizens of Abra for Good Government: Bantay Lansangan (Road Watch)

Findings:

- Most government projects claimed to be completed in Abra were actually just beginning or were halfway through the construction phase.
- 11 officials from the public works sector were suspended for dishonesty and misconduct.
- COA partnered with the CCAGG in carrying out participatory auditing, which was later replicated in other parts of the country.
Citizen Participatory Audit

Enhancing Transparency, Accountability and Citizen Participation in the Public Audit Process

In April 2012, ANSA-EAP and the Commission on Audit of the Philippines (COA) formalized a partnership to implement a two-year Participatory Audit Program that focuses on providing technical assistance to the COA in its efforts to open public audit processes to citizens. Its overall goal is to contribute to improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the use of public resources.

Under the program, COA and ANSA-EAP will design, test and institutionalize the conduct of participatory audits through several pilot projects.

In participatory audit, citizens (civil society, academic groups, community members, private sector) and the COA work together to audit the processes of delivering public services and government programs. As a result, transparency and accountability in the way government performs its functions is enhanced.

The components of the program are:

- Partnership Building - Terms of Engagement among stakeholders will be established through a consultative and collaborative approach. Project designs will be drawn to specify parameters and operational approaches to pilot the participatory audit services undertaken by COA.
- Capacity Development - This will build the capacity of primary stakeholders, mainly civil society actors, COA auditors, and other government officials to undertake participatory audits. For greater effectiveness, capacity building will be carried out in actual work situations and be oriented towards improving practice.
- Public Communication - An integrated communication plan will be designed to create awareness of the program, and generate support for it from internal and external stakeholders.
Citizen Participatory Audit Reports

- Barangay Health Centers
- CPA Brochure
- Farm-to-Market-Road (FMR) Project
- KAMANAVA Flood Control Project
- Local Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Fund (LDRRMF)
- Solid Waste Management (SWM) Program
- Tourism Road Infrastructure Project (TRIP)
- Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Project

Display #: 20
Enabling Conditions: Supply-Side

- Political culture and democratic space
- Enabling rules and legislation
- Open data: citizens’ access to reliable public documents and data (e.g. Transparency Seal in national agencies, Full Disclosure Policy at the sub-national levels)
- Right to information: FOI in the Executive Branch
- Budget support for Open data infrastructure
- Capacity building for Government Agencies on Public Participation
Annual Budget
Quarterly Statement of Cash Flow
Statement of Debt
Bid Results
Statement of Receipts and Expenditures
Special Education Fund Use
Annual Procurement Plan
Unliquidated Cash Advance
Annual Procurement List
Manpower Complement
Annual Use of GAD Funds
Supplemental Procurement Plan
Trust Fund Utilization
20% of IRA Component
Utilization of Local DRRM Fund
Role of Infomediaries and Think Tanks

- Transparency became a supply-driven exercise for LGUs. Compliance with the Full Disclosure Policy became a barren exercise when there are no users of the publicly-disclosed data.

- The weak local stakeholder up-take to use open government data stems from lack of awareness, capacity, incentives, and knowledge of citizens to concretize the everyday benefits of open government.

- One way to improve the use of FDP data is to bring in local knowledge stakeholders and develop platforms that can serve as info-mediaries in translating open government data into knowledge products.
Enabling Conditions: Demand-Side

- Availability and accessibility of independent media that enable the public to engage in discussions pertaining to public issues
- Capacity, legitimacy, representativeness, responsiveness, and accountability of civil society actors
- Role of data, infomediaries, and policy think tanks
- Public participation in legislative oversight mechanisms
THANK YOU!